

~~SECRET~~  
Department of State

INCOMING  
TELEGRAM

RELEASE IN  
PART B6

PAGE 01 SANTIAGO 09018 041811Z  
ACTION SF-02

2226

SANTIAGO 09018 041811Z

INFO OCT-01 ES-01 ISO-00 SSO-00 /004 V  
-----057712 041821Z /70

O 041725Z NOV 77  
FM AMEMBASSY SANTIAGO  
TO SECSTATE WASHDC HIACIT IMMEDIATE 7052

ALREADY TAKEN BY YOUR GOVERNMENT TO SAFEGUARD AND PROMOTE HUMAN RIGHTS. I SINCERELY HOPE THAT IT WILL BE POSSIBLE TO UNDERTAKE FURTHER INITIATIVES IN THE NEAR FUTURE AND THAT CHILE WILL SOON TAKE ITS RIGHTFUL PLACE AGAIN AMONG THE NATIONS THAT HAVE FULLY CONSTITUTIONAL PARTICIPATORY DEMOCRACIES. END QUOTE.

6. SINGED: \_\_\_\_\_  
BOYATT

B6

~~SECRET~~ SANTIAGO 9018

DISSENT CHANNEL////////////////////////////////////

E. O. 11652: GDS  
TAGS: CI, SHUN  
SUBJECT: DISSENT MESSAGE: REDRAFTING OF CARTER/PINOCHET LETTER

THIS MESSAGE TRANSMITS A DISSENT CHANNEL VIEWPOINT

REF: STATE 262396

REQUESTED DISTRIBUTION: ARA AND HSC

1. THE UNDERSIGNED BELIEVE THAT TRANSMITTAL TO PRESIDENT PINOCHET OF THE LETTER FROM PRESIDENT CARTER (REFTEL) WOULD NEEDLESSLY PREJUDICE REAL HUMAN RIGHTS IMPROVEMENT IN CHILE. ACCORDINGLY, WE PROPOSE THAT IT BE REDRAFTED TO TAKE INTO ACCOUNT THE CHRONOLOGY OF EVENTS DURING THIS WEEK AND TO CLARIFY THAT THE US DOES NOT INTEND TO IMPOSE A SPECIFIC POLITICAL STRUCTURE ON CHILE.

2. OBJECTION 1: ON NOVEMBER 3, THE GOC ANNOUNCED THAT DIHA/CHI HEAD MANUEL CONTRERAS WOULD BE REPLACED BY RETIRED ARMY GENERAL MENA, WHO MAY HAVE BEEN FORCED INTO RETIREMENT IN OCTOBER 1975 BECAUSE OF HIS OPPOSITION TO THEN-DIHA'S ABUSES. ON NOVEMBER 4, PRESIDENT PINOCHET TOLD US CONFIDENTIALLY THAT HE PLANNED TO COMMUTE THE SENTENCES OF PENDING DL 504 CASES AND SPEED UP THE PROCESSING OF THOSE IN TRIAL.

3. THE CARTER/PINOCHET LETTER BEARS THE DATE OCTOBER 31. ONCE THAT LETTER BECOMES PUBLIC (AND WE ARE SURE THAT IT WILL) PINOCHET WILL BE SEEN TO HAVE BEEN REACTING TO THIS USG PRESSURE. PINOCHET WILL CERTAINLY COMPREHEND HIS SITUATION AS SOON AS HE RECEIVES THE LETTER -- WITH UNFORETOLD CONSEQUENCES TO HIS STILL PRIVATE DECISION ON THE PRISONER RELEASE AND, WORSE, WITH THE LONG-RUN FEELING THAT HE HAD BEEN VICTIMIZED BY PRESIDENT CARTER. ACCORDINGLY, WE BELIEVE THE LETTER SHOULD BE REDRAFTED IN KNOWLEDGE THAT THE GOC TOOK AND WAS PLANNING TO TAKE THE AFOREMENTIONED STEPS. PARA 5 CONTAINS SUGGESTED WORDING.

4. OBJECTION 2: AS NOW DRAFTED, THE THIRD PARAGRAPH OF THE LETTER SPEAKS OF THE NEED "TO RESTORE" THE "DEMOCRATIC TRADITION" IN CHILE. IN THE CHILEAN CONTEXT, IT HAS A VERY SPECIFIC MEANING: A REPLICATION OF THE POLITICAL STRUCTURE EXISTING PRIOR TO THE 1973 COUP. NEITHER THE GOC NOR FUTURE HISTORIANS ARE LIKELY TO INTERPRET THIS SENTENCE AS WRITTEN TO MEAN OTHER THAN AN ADMINISTRATION ATTEMPT TO IMPOSE A SPECIFIC POLITICAL STRUCTURE IN CHILE. FURTHERMORE, THE MILITARY HAS, AS A BASIC TENET, INSISTED THAT IT WOULD NOT RESTORE THE OLD SYSTEM. EVEN SOME DEMOCRATIC CRITICS OF THE REGIME URGE SIGNIFICANT INSTITUTIONAL CHANGES. BY MAKING "RESTORATION" A SINE QUA NON FOR IMPROVED RELATIONS WE WILL HAVE EFFECTIVELY ELIMINATED OUR LEVERAGE ON THE GOC FOR PROGRESSIVE CHANGES, THE EVENTUAL OUTCOME OF WHICH NEITHER WE NOR THE GOC CAN PREDICT AT THIS TIME. PARA 5 INCORPORATES MORE APPROPRIATE WORDING.

5. WE URGE REPLACING EXISTING PARA 3 OF TEXT OF REFTEL WITH:  
QUOTE: AS I NOTED DURING OUR CONVERSATION, HUMAN RIGHTS CONSIDERATIONS REMAIN THE MAJOR OBSTACLE TO RESTORATION OF THE TRADITIONALLY CLOSE RELATIONS BETWEEN THE UNITED STATES AND CHILE. I EARNESTLY HOPE SUCH FRIENDLY AND CLOSE RELATIONS CAN GRADUALLY BE REESTABLISHED BETWEEN OUR TWO COUNTRIES. I APPRECIATE THE STEPS

CONFIDENTIAL

Department of State

OUTGOING TELEGRAM

(2)

PAGE 01 STATE 265529

ORIGIN SP-02

RELEASE IN PART B6

INFO OCT-01 ES-01 ISO-00 /004 R

DRAFTED BY S/P: RFEINBERG  
APPROVED BY S/P: PKREISBERG  
DESIRED DISTRIBUTION  
S/P ONLY

-----099453 051816Z /53

O 051759Z NOV 77 ZFF4  
FM SECSTATE WASHDC  
TO AMEMBASSY SANTIAGO NIACT IMMEDIATE

~~CONFIDENTIAL~~ STATE 265529

DISSENT CHANNEL FOR  ONLY FROM KREISBERG, S/P

B6

E.O. 11652: GDS

AGS:

SUBJECT: DISSENT CHANNEL MESSAGE: LETTER FROM PRESIDENT CARTER TO PRESIDENT PINOCHET

REF: A) SANTIAGO 9018 B) STATE 262398

1. THANK YOU FOR YOUR RAPID AND THOUGHTFUL DISSENT MESSAGE.
2. YOUR OPINIONS WERE GIVEN HIGH-LEVEL CONSIDERATION, BUT IT WAS DECIDED THAT THE LETTER TO PRESIDENT PINOCHET AS SIGNED BY PRESIDENT CARTER AND CONTAINED IN REF (B) SHOULD GO FORWARD UNALTERED AS SOON AS POSSIBLE.
3. A MORE LENGTHY RESPONSE TO YOUR PARTICULAR ARGUMENTS WILL FOLLOW. YOUR USE OF THE DISSENT CHANNEL IS COMMENDED. CHRISTOPHER

RELEASE IN PART  
B6.

~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

S/P:RFEINBERG:RYM  
11/30/77 EXT 20822  
S/P:PKREISBERG

ARA-MR. F. MCNEIL {SUBS}

S/P ONLY

ROUTINE SANTIAGO

DISSENT CHANNEL FOR [REDACTED] FROM LAKE-S/P

E.O. 11652: GDS

TAGS: CI, SHUM

SUBJECT: LETTER FROM PRESIDENT CARTER TO PRESIDENT  
PINOCHET-DISSENT CHANNEL MESSAGE

REF: A) SANTIAGO 09018; B) STATE 262398; C) SANTIAGO 8838

1. AS YOU ARE AWARE, THE VIEWS PRESENTED IN YOUR RAPKD ID  
AND THOUGHTFUL DISSENT MESSAGE WERE GIVEN IMMEDIATE CONSI-  
DERATION AT THE HIGHEST LEVELS OF THE USG.

2. YOUR FIRST CONCERN CENTERED ON THE PROPOSED PRISONER RE-  
LEASES. THE JUDGMENT HERE TO GO AHEAD RESTED ON THE BE-  
LIEF THAT THE LETTER WAS PRIVATE, NOT TO BE MADE PUBLIC,  
AND THEREFORE OFFERED NO PUBLIC CHALLENGE TO THE GOC THAT  
WOULD IMPEL IT TO GET BACK AT US ON THE PRISONER RELEASE  
QUESTION. WE BELIEVE THAT YOUR CONCERN ABOUT GIVING RECOG-  
NITION TO PRISONER RELEASES COULD BE MET BY THE STRATEGY  
OUTLINED IN PARAGRAPH FIVE REFTEL {C}, THAT IS IF THE GOC  
TRANSLATES ITS ACCEPTANCE OF THE ICEM PROPOSAL INTO ACTION  
THE USG WILL MAKE THE PROMISED PUBLIC RESPONSE.

3. THERE WAS INTENSIVE RECONSIDERATION OF THE QUESTION OF  
WHETHER THE USE OF THE WORD QUOTE RESTORE UNQUOTE IN THE  
PRESIDENT'S LETTER IMPLIED A RETURN TO A SPECIFIC SET OF

PHK  
RF  
FM

B6

~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

12

INSTITUTIONS. THE FINAL DECISION RESTED ON THE BELIEF THAT THE PHASE QUOTE TO RESTORE TO CHILE THE VIGOROUS AND OPEN DEMOCRATIC TRADITION UNQUOTE DID NOT NECESSARILY REFER BACK TO PRE-1973 INSTITUTIONS, BUT RATHER TO A MORE GENERAL TRADITION OF HONORING DEMOCRATIC PRACTICES AND PROCEDURES. THE PHRASE WAS MEANT AS A RESTATEMENT OF THE GLOBAL ADMINISTRATION POLICY OF PREFERRING DEMOCRACY, NOTABLY IN A COUNTRY WITH A LONG HISTORY OF IT.

4. COPIES OF YOUR MESSAGE WERE DELIVERED TO THE OFFICES OF THE SECRETARY, THE EXECUTIVE SECRETARY, THE CHAIRMAN OF THE OPEN FORUM, THE ASSISTANT SECRETARY FOR INTER-AMERICAN AFFAIRS, AND THE NSC.

5. YOUR USE OF THE DISSENT CHANNEL IS COMMENDED. 44